From: Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <bri>deral <bri>deral <brian.ellrott@noaa.gov>

Sent: Tuesday, May 7, 2019 11:22 AM

To: Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal; Garwin Yip

Cc: Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal; Evan Sawyer - NOAA Affiliate

Subject: Re: E-mail 4 (last): ROC on LTO draft BiOp sections for QA/QC review

I'm finishing up Rosalie's comments on the w-r I&S today. This is the latest version: 2.8 Integration and Synthesis ELLROTT WR V2.rd bje

The latest s-r I&S has not been reviewed by Rosalie yet. My plan is to finish Rosalie's comments on w-r, then make changes to s-r based on the applicable comments from the w-r draft. latest s-r version: 2.8 Integration and Synthesis ELLROTT SR V1 srb.

On Tue, May 7, 2019 at 10:44 AM Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal < <u>naseem.alston@noaa.gov</u>> wrote: Hi all,

I'm a little confused by the versions of I&S that Garwin just sent out.

The winter-run one seems to be reviewed and marked up (especially the table), while the spring-run isn't - and seems to have many of the same rows in the tables that are now crossed out in w-run, etc.

Have the others been revised according to review of winter-run (if that is the only one reviewed)? and if not should they be before sending them out for broader reviews?

Naseem O. Alston
ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
California Central Valley Office
Sacramento, CA
(916)930-3655
http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <garwin.yip@noaa.gov>

Date: Mon, May 6, 2019 at 11:43 PM

Subject: E-mail 4 (last): ROC on LTO draft BiOp sections for QA/QC review

To: Maria Rea - NOAA Federal < <u>maria.rea@noaa.gov</u>>, Christopher Keifer < <u>Christopher.Keifer@noaa.gov</u>>,

Rosalie B. del Rosario < Rosalie.del Rosario @noaa.gov >

Cc: Howard Brown < Howard.Brown@noaa.gov >, Cathy Marcinkevage < cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov >, Susan Boring < susan boring@fws.gov >, Naseem Alston < Naseem.Alston@noaa.gov >

All,

Attached are clean versions of the yellow-highlighted sections.

1 Introduction:

- 1.1 Background [Garwin (C) drafted; Barb reviewed
- **1.2 COA** [Garwin (C) drafted; Barb reviewed]
- **1.3 Key consultation considerations** [Garwin (C) drafted; Barb, Cathy, Howard reviewed)
- **1.4 Consultation history** [Brittany drafted based on initiation memo; Garwin reviewed)
- 1.5 Proposed Federal Action [Evan drafted; Howard, Amanda, Barb, Naseem, Garwin (C) reviewed]
- **2.1 Analytical approach** [Evan and Cathy drafted; Howard, Naseem (C), Rosalie (C), Chris (C), Maria, Garwin (C) reviewed]
- **2.2 Status of the species and CH** [Brittany and Page drafted; Barb, Amanda, Chris (C), Naseem, Garwin reviewed (C)]
- **2.3 Action Area** [Evan drafted; Barb, Naseem (C), Rosalie (C), Garwin (C) reviewed]
- 2.4 Environmental Baseline [Brian drafted; Page, Naseem (C), Brian, Rosalie, Chris, Garwin (C) reviewed]
- 2.5 & 2.6 Effects of the Action on species and CH

Stressor introductions [Evan, Stephen, Kate drafted]

American River Division [Brian drafted; Brittany revised, Garwin reviewed x 2]

Clear Creek [Sarah drafted; Brittany revised, Garwin reviewed x 3]

Shasta Division [Evan drafted; Cathy revised x 3, Garwin reviewed x 3, Maria & Rosalie reviewed]

East Side Division [Barb drafted; Kristin revised, Garwin reviewed x 2]

Delta Division [Jeff drafted; Barb revised, Maria reviewed, Garwin reviewed x 2]

SRKW [Dan drafted; Jeff and Barb reviewed]

Chinook salmon analysis [John Hannon drafted; Dan, Jeff, Barb reviewed

Climate change [Cathy drafted; Garwin reviewed]

Benefits of ongoing restoration to include in multiple sections [Naseem drafted; Garwin (C)

reviewed]

- **2.5.9 Life cycle model results** [Cathy drafted; Evan revised]
- **2.7 Cumulative effects** [Brittany drafted, Garwin (C) reviewed]

2.8: Integration and Synthesis

Winter-run Chinook salmon [Brian drafted; Howard, Cathy, Naseem, Evan, Rosalie reviewed] CV spring-run Chinook salmon [Brian drafted; Barb, Cathy, Kristin, Naseem, Evan reviewed]

CCV steelhead [Joe drafted; Barb, Sarah, Jeff, Rosalie, Garwin reviewed]

sDPS green sturgeon [Joe drafted; Rosalie, Garwin reviewed]

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611

Cell: 916-716-6558 FAX: 916-930-3629

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



On Mon, May 6, 2019 at 10:26 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <<u>garwin.yip@noaa.gov</u>> wrote: All,

Attached are clean versions of the yellow-highlighted sections.

I forgot to mention in the last e-mail that the "Stressor introductions" section will be the first section of the effects section.

As you will see, the "Benefits of ongoing restoration to include in multiple sections" section comprises text that will go in to multiple sections of the BiOp. It addresses those Proposed Action components (largely restoration) that have completed section 7 consultations, but with ongoing benefits to the listed species or their designated critical habitats.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814 Office: 916-930-3611 Cell: 916-716-6558 FAX: 916-930-3629

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



On Mon, May 6, 2019 at 9:46 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal < garwin.yip@noaa.gov > wrote: All.

Attached are clean versions of the yellow-highlighted sections, except for the upper Sac/Shasta Division, which Rosalie just reviewed. Next to the bolded section "titles" are the drafters and reviewers of the sections. "(C)" means cleared.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce California Central Valley Office 650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100 Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611 Cell: 916-716-6558 FAX: 916-930-3629

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



On Mon, May 6, 2019 at 4:20 PM Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <maria.rea@noaa.gov> wrote: Thanks, Garwin. I'll wait to see your batched emails and and download them on my lap top for quality plane time on Wednesday! I'll also spend a few hours on Thursday. As you know, Friday is booked with Barry meetings. My review may go over the weekend as well; to be realistic. I would like to see (if possible) a track changes version of Shasta and Delta with my comments embedded and the responses. In the past its also been really helpful to me to see Rosalie's comments, for example on the I and S sections.

Can you confirm all of these sections already have your and Naseem's review and clearance?

Thank you for all your hard work on this.

- M

Sent from my iPad

- > On May 6, 2019, at 4:31 PM, Garwin Yip NOAA Federal <garwin.yip@noaa.gov> wrote:
- > All,

>

- > Today (through this Friday, May 10) marks the initiation of the first QA/QC
- > review of the ROC on LTO draft BiOp. Rather than send the draft BiOp in a
- > single file (which is too big to do anyway), I am sending in separate files
- > for easier management. Below are the sections that I expect to send to you
- > before I call it a day today. Attached are the sections highlighted in
- > yellow.
- > Please provide comments in track changes. All of the sections coming to you
- > will be clean. If you have reviewed an earlier draft, and want to see those
- > comments (or how we addressed them), let me know, and I/we will try to
- > accommodate.

>

```
> -Garwin-
> *Garwin Yip*
> Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief
> NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
> U.S. Department of Commerce
> California Central Valley Office
> 650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
> Sacramento, CA 95814
> Office: 916-930-3611
> Cell: 916-716-6558
> FAX: 916-930-3629
> www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov <a href="http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov">http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov</a>>
> <2-2-Status-of-Species-and-CH--to reviewers.docx>
> <1.1-1.5 Intro-for reviewers.docx>
> <2-3-Action-Area--to reviewers.docx>
> <2-1_Analytical_Approach--to reviewers.docx>
```

--

Brian Ellrott

Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce

Mobile: 916-955-7628 Office: 916-930-3612 brian.ellrott@noaa.gov