NATIONAL OCEANIC & ATMOSPHERIC ADMINISTRATION (NOAA) NORTH ATLANTIC REGIONAL TEAM (NART) TRIBAL ENGAGEMENT ASSESSMENT





Prepared by the National Center for Environmental Conflict Resolution:

Dana Goodson & Courtney Owen

November 2021

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND	3
THEMES FROM ASSESSMENT INTERVIEWS: TRIBAL REPRESENTATIVES	
THEMES FROM ASSESSMENT INTERVIEWS: NOAA STAFF & THEIR PARTNERS	
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	19
APPENDIX A: List of Tribal Representatives Interviewed	26
APPENDIX B: List of NOAA Staff & Their Partners Interviewed	27
APPENDIX C: List of Guiding Questions for Tribal Representatives	29
APPENDIX D: List of Guiding Questions for NOAA Staff & Their Partners	30
APPENDIX E: List of Tribes and NOAA Projects/Programs	31
APPENDIX F: Resources Shared	30

BACKGROUND

The National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's (NOAA) North Atlantic Regional Collaboration Team (NART) sought to identify ways NOAA offices can better coordinate their outreach and work with Native American Governments ("Native Nations¹") and organizations – and thus more effectively provide services to Native Nations and enhance Government-to-Government relations. In the fall of 2020, NOAA contracted with the Udall Foundation's National Center for Environmental Conflict Resolution (National Center) to conduct an independent, neutral assessment to learn about the needs, issues, priorities, opportunities, and obstacles associated with NOAA's relationships and activities with Native Nations and Tribal organizations in NOAA's North Atlantic region (comprising of New England and the Mid-Atlantic regions). The assessment identifies what's working well, recommendations for improvement, and opportunities.

The findings categorized and summarized throughout the assessment report include general themes that were identified by assessment interviews with interviewees. The discussions were confidential and the information in this report is not attributed to specific individuals, but instead captures high-level themes from the interviews. These themes summarize the diverse perspectives of the interviewees and may be used to better understand what is needed for successful Tribal engagement with NOAA staff and their partners. Resources shared by interviewees during the interviews can be found in Appendix F.

Interviews with Tribal Representatives: The National Center contacted 38 Tribal representatives from 18 Federally recognized Tribes and 1 Tribal representative from the United South and Eastern Tribes, Inc. (USET). One-hour phone interviews were conducted with 19 Tribal representatives representing 13 Tribal Nations and 1 Tribal representative from USET between July - October 2021. Each interviewee was then asked a standardized list of pre-determined questions, with additional follow-up questions unique to each interviewee emerging from the dialogue between interviewer and interviewee as the interview progressed. A list of Tribal representatives interviewed (Appendix A) and assessment interview questions (Appendix C) are included for reference.

Interviews with NOAA Staff and Their Partners: The National Center contacted 33 NOAA staff and partners to interview. The National Center held concurrent group interviews for the Mid-Atlantic and New England regions on May 26th and June 9th, respectively. The group interviews were conducted virtually via Microsoft Teams for two-hours. In total, 25 participants were interviewed. The participants were self-selected volunteers and their roles with NOAA ranged from those who are working on local specific projects with Tribes to those working on a region-wide scale. The breakdown of the participants and their programs is outlined below:

- NOAA: 14 participants from 5 Line Offices in 12 distinct programs/offices
- Sea Grant: 7 participants from 6 Sea Grant Programs
- Partners: 4 participants from 3 NOAA partners organizations (NERACOOS, MARACOOS, and the College of William and Mary)

Each group interview was asked a standardized list of pre-determined questions. A list of NOAA staff and their partners interviewed (<u>Appendix B</u>) and assessment interview questions (<u>Appendix D</u>) are included for further reference.

¹ For purposes of this assessment and based on responses the terms Native Nations, Tribes, and Tribal Governments are used interchangeably to refer to the indigenous sovereign nations of the United States.

Prior to the group interviews with NOAA and their partners, the National Center led an initial survey to identify projects NOAA and their partners were working on with the Tribes in the region. Twenty-seven participants responded to the survey. The survey was voluntary and not all NOAA participants shared information on their projects due to concerns about preserving relationships with Tribal partners and sensitivities around how information might be shared. The survey responses were compiled and shared with identified Tribal partners to give them some background on the types of projects NOAA is working on with Tribes in the region. The list developed from the surveys and shared with Tribes can be found in Appendix E.

About the Udall Foundation's National Center

The Udall Foundation's National Center² is an independent federal program established by Congress to provide collaboration, consensus-building, and conflict resolution services on environmental, natural, and cultural resources, and public lands issues involving Federal agencies, Tribal Governments, States, and stakeholders. The National Center serves as an impartial, non-partisan institution providing professional expertise and services to all involved. The facilitation team from the National Center consisted of Dana Goodson and Courtney Owen.

² Additional information about the National Center is available at www.udall.gov.

THEMES FROM ASSESSMENT INTERVIEWS: TRIBAL REPRESENTATIVES

WHAT IS WORKING WELL

Success Stories Identified by Tribal Representatives

The following are some examples raised by Tribal representatives in the interviews; it is not an exhaustive list:

- The Shinnecock Roundtable in 2018 was a good way for NOAA to interact with the Tribe.
- The Greater Atlantic Regional Fisheries Office (GARFO) hosted a writing retreat at their facilities and the Tribes found it valuable to see the seafood testing and other projects at GARFO.
- NOAA and Tribes developed an effective partnership around the Marine Mammal Stranding Network³, thanks to the dedicated efforts of a NOAA staff person.
- NOAA's regional aquaculture staff person has been helpful in coordinating with the Aroostook Band of Micmac Indians and the University of Maine Aquaculture Institute to advance the Tribe's aquaculture project.
- Certain regional staff members have created good working relationships with Tribal representatives.

OPPORTUNITIES FOR IMPROVING RELATIONSHIPS WITH NOAA STAFF & THEIR PARTNERS

Tribal Partners' Priorities Relevant to NOAA's Mission

- Understanding and connecting waterways to the ocean environment. Some Tribes are not
 directly on the coast, but they are affected by marine environments. Tribes emphasized the
 importance of a connected ecosystem between oceans and other waterways such as rivers. This
 is particularly important for anadromous fish that are essential to Tribal culture and lifeways,
 such as Atlantic salmon, American eel, and river herring, including alewife
- Water quality monitoring and restoration
- Shellfish farming and the effects of climate change on the shellfish
- Preservation of coastal habitats such as brackish and saltwater marshes
- Oyster reefs
- Sustainable fisheries
- Species restoration, in particular anadromous fish such as Atlantic salmon, American eel, and river herring, including alewife

³ From the Greater Atlantic Marine Mammal Stranding Network webpage: "The Greater Atlantic Region Marine Mammal Stranding Network was created to provide a consistent framework in which to collect, compile, and share data about marine mammal strandings throughout the region, which extends from the Virginia/North Carolina border north to our border with Canada. The network is composed of state and federal wildlife and fisheries agencies, veterinary clinics, non-profit agencies, and academic institutions who respond to or provide professional advice on responding to strandings." Available at https://www.fisheries.noaa.gov/new-england-mid-atlantic/marine-life-distress/greater-atlantic-marine-mammal-stranding-network#greater-atlantic-region-stranding-network-members (accessed October 20, 2021).

- Resource protection to help preserve and support traditional and culturally significant saltwater fishing
- Building better community and public understanding and support for restoration programs, such as the NOAA Salmon Recovery Program, through community outreach and education efforts
- Climate change and climate resiliency/adaptation including:
 - Ocean acidification
 - Rising sea levels
 - Erosion on the coastline
 - Shoreline restoration
 - Climate change projections
 - Warming seas and climates
- Weather-related events such as more frequent and more powerful storms and surges as well as stormwater mitigation
- Data gathering (acidity of the waters, temperature, etc.) using buoys
- Develop education programs, such as whale watching programs

Relationship Building and Trust

• **Relationship with Tribes:** Some Tribal representatives who regularly interact with NOAA on specific projects reported having good working relationships with NOAA regional staff, finding them supportive and responsive. Many noted, however, that they had little contact with NOAA (or were unaware of significant contact) and did not have a good sense of what the agency does.

A couple interviewees pointed to one instance in particular as causing strained relationships between NOAA and East Coast Tribes: when Federal COVID relief funds for fishing was set aside for Alaska and West Coast Native Nations, but the funds for East Coast Native Nations were funneled through States.⁴ This funding ultimately did not get allocated to the East Coast Native Nations and interviewees felt that this was discriminatory, did not account for the historically tense relationships between some East Coast States and Native Nations, and failed to honor the Federal government's trust responsibility towards Native Nations. The interviewees emphasized that NOAA should avoid having funding for Native Nations go through States.

- Interviewee quote: "NOAA should speak individually with Tribes. In relation to the COVID 19 issues, they never made an apology. Some type of acknowledgement should be made. A commitment should be made to have a true G2G relationship with Tribes."
- Regular and sustained outreach: Almost all Tribal interviewees noted that they would welcome more interaction with NOAA and would appreciate more information about what NOAA does and how the agency could support Tribal priorities. Tribes may have newer staff people working in the areas relevant to NOAA's mission, have turnover in those positions due to lack of sustained funding, or may have few staff managing many areas of the Tribe's environmental and emergency management response. It is important to understand, therefore, that current Tribal staff may not be aware of projects or attempts at outreach that occurred even just a few years ago. More sustained and relevant outreach to the correct Tribal contacts is necessary. Comments included:

⁴ "Commerce Secretary Announces Allocation of \$300 million in CARES Act funding, https://www.fisheries.noaa.gov/feature-story/commerce-secretary-announces-allocation-300-million-cares-act-funding (accessed October 15, 2021).

- Establish informal lines of communication outside or in addition to the formal lines of communication (i.e., G2G consultation) and build relationships with Tribal counterparts such as the THPO office.
- Reach out to Tribes with formal or informal consultation at the outset of a project or proposed action instead of waiting until the decision-making stage. This would result in better use of Tribal and NOAA resources and could result in better projects/actions.
- Direct in-person (if possible) or virtual (via e-mail or virtual platform) meetings to discuss opportunities with NOAA and the Tribe as well as establish relationships.
- Engage all interested Tribes, including inland Tribes that may not be on the coast. They
 may be interested because of wider ecosystem connections or traditional territories on
 the coast.
- High staff turnover on the NOAA side also makes it hard to build relationships.
- o **Interviewee quote:** "Once we identify our key person at a Federal agency, it is a good working relationship. We just need to get the relationship off of the ground."
- **Tribal priorities:** There has been a lack of consultation (informal or formal) with Native Nations on their priorities and decision-making processes. For example, some recently Federally recognized Virginia Tribes have not been formally contacted, consulted, or invited to collaborate with NOAA. It is important to listen to the Tribes' specific needs and engage in Government-to-Government (G2G) consultation when appropriate. When consulting, it is important to consult and follow through in timely manner, as well as keep Tribal partners updated as decision-making progresses.
 - On An interviewee suggested that NOAA could review the Tribal sections of the Northeast Ocean Plan and the Mid-Atlantic Regional Ocean Action Plan to determine how the agency could best contribute to those sections, such as improving understanding of Tribal resources, including submerged archeological and paleocultural landscapes; identifying areas and impacts to places of cultural significance using marine life and habitat data; and moving forward on shellfish bed restoration opportunities.
 - o **Interviewee quote:** "NOAA has just been deciding when they want to talk to Tribes about things. I don't know what they're basing those decisions on."
 - Interviewee quote: "We need to be consulted with before plans of action are developed.
 Not as an afterthought to meet Section 106 guidelines. Our voices and ideas should be heard, even if an agreeable resolution is not attained."
- Honoring the Government-to-Government relationship: Some interviewees felt that NOAA should take a leadership role in making a strong statement of their responsibility and commitment to engaging with Tribes in the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic on a G2G basis:
 - NOAA should publicly reaffirm their commitment to Executive Order 13175
 "Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments "as EPA has done, for example.⁵
 - NOAA should also develop a guidance policy for working with Tribes in the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic and address how the agency will fulfill its G2G and trust responsibilities to Tribes in those regions, particularly in light of pressures on Tribal sovereignty and rights from other actors, such as the fishing industry.

⁵ "EPA Reaffirms 20 Years of Partnership with Indian Tribes," https://www.epa.gov/sites/default/files/2013-08/documents/indian-policy-leavitt-pr.pdf (accessed October 13, 2021).

- Interviewee quote: "The consultation policy . . . should talk about how NOAA should help address the attacks on Tribal sovereignty."
- Confidentiality needs: While Native Nations are often open to discussion and sharing
 information, it is important to know there are boundaries and concerns about data sovereignty.
 Agencies must be respectful of Tribal requests to not share that information and recognize that
 there is some information they are comfortable sharing and some information that they are not
 comfortable sharing.
 - Consider establishing confidentiality agreements with Tribal partners when relevant. The Northeast Ocean Data Portal agreement was suggested as a good example.
 - As part of G2G consultation, consider co-developing with Tribes best practices to set up data agreements as part of consultation policy.
- **Respectful engagement:** Interviewees emphasized the need for respectful, culturally sensitive engagement. Comments included:
 - Attend and learn at Tribally-led meetings.
 - o If possible, hold in-person meetings with Tribal and Federal staff and leadership.
 - All Tribal governments operate differently. Recognize that Tribal decision-making processes are different.
 - Set clear expectations on informal consultation and G2G consultation when consulting with Tribal Governments. Clarify terms before consulting.
 - Include NOAA HQ and higher-level staff in meetings with Tribes as appropriate to help make decisions on resource allocations and shared projects more responsive to Tribal interests and needs.
 - Interviewee quote: "Regionally, we've been really fortunate because there are really amazing people who have helped make things happen for us... But it only extends as far as individuals. Regional or headquarters staff doesn't always come with them. It would be nice if [decisions on shared projects] could be made from the ground up instead of someone sitting in an office. So, the folks on the ground could have a better say in what happens instead."
 - Do research on the Tribe you are speaking with to understand the culture, perspective, and history of the Tribe and learn about culturally significant sites.
 - Interviewee quote: "They should know the rivers in Virginia are named after Tribes. NOAA should know where the village sites were. This is where we would be most interested in any cultural or environmental concerns."
 - After you have done your background research, if you have questions, just ask. Ideally, agency staff will have established a relationship with a point of contact from the Tribe who can help them with any questions.
- Thoughtful and respectful meeting format and platforms: Interviewees who had participated
 in previous NOAA engagements with Tribes had observations on some of the obstacles to good
 engagement:
 - NOAA does not have an effective platform for virtual consultation, especially through the COVID-19 pandemic. Their platform is not user-friendly nor accessible to all Tribes.
 - Virtual meetings are set up as a one-sided discussion where NOAA does most of the talking. It is important to lead less and listen more – NOAA should seek to create spaces that are Tribally led.

 In-person meetings are sometimes difficult to get to and there is no funding for Tribal staff to attend the meetings.

Information Sharing and Communication

- Information on NOAA's mission and activities: Most interviewees indicated they had little familiarity with the broad reach of NOAA's mission and activities and how they might align with the Tribe's needs and priorities. More involvement and outreach from NOAA are needed, as well as clarity around what NOAA can and cannot do within its mission. In-person meetings were cited as the best way to communicate with Tribes. Emails to the correct points of contact were cited as the second-best way to communicate with Tribes.
 - In one example, an interviewee noted that NOAA has not been clear about their contingency plans for affected marine species in the context of offshore wind development.
- **Relevant communications:** It is important that communications on the opportunities available get to the right people. For example, information on opportunities available to Tribal fishermen.
- **Tribal liaisons:** There needs to be greater presence of Tribal liaisons at NOAA. When a Tribal liaison is established, NOAA should send a letter to the Tribe introducing the liaison.
 - o Interviewee quote: "Because NOAA is so compartmentalized, it would be helpful to create a coordinated effort, relationship so when NOAA reaches out, everyone knows what they're doing, there's a plan. Every agency has a liaison; [their] effectiveness depends on how institutionalized [they are], so not all on one individual, it's truly integrated into how agency works and thinks."
- **Tribal information and data needs:** Interviewees indicated a number of areas where they have data and information needs that NOAA could potentially support:
 - Develop a contact list of NOAA staff and the programs they are associated with so Tribal representatives can reach out with questions.
 - Develop data sharing and collection programs, such as the sea-level rise mapper, in partnership with Tribes and/or give grants to Tribes to collect relevant and needed data.
 - Hold conversations on building on best practices for working with Native Nations effectively, including around confidentiality and data collection and management.
 - o Include TEK and Tribal knowledge into projects and programs, such as weather programs, marine resources, and climate change preparation plans.
 - Share information on ocean floor mapping, what's been done and what could be done that is Tribally led.
 - Interviewee quote: "Respect and understanding TEK [traditional ecological knowledge] and approaching conversations with mutual respect. There is a lot of knowledge that the Elders hold. Ask what information the Tribes have to offer. The Elders or Knowledge Keepers don't think to offer unless they're asked."
 - Share education materials and resources.
 - For example, one Tribe is hosting environmental education week for Tribal youth next summer. The Tribe would like any curriculum or education materials as well as resources such as instructors for this environmental education week.

Capacity and Funding for Tribal Partners

- **Limitations on Tribal capacity:** Recognizing that some Tribes only have one person to a department, they are stretched thin; some Tribes are newly recognized and so they are still getting set up.
- Funding for capacity building: While some Tribes have received funding from NOAA for specific projects, the funding from NOAA and other relevant agencies is often limited and piecemeal, which can mean that Tribes cannot consistently support staff working on ocean and coastal issues for the long-term, persistent efforts that are needed for actions like coastal restoration and species recovery. Inconsistent funding can also make it difficult to recruit and retain staff. Interviewees offered specific examples of activities that could be funded or otherwise supported to build needed capacity:
 - Staff positions for fisheries biologists
 - Internship program to train students as fisheries biologists and work in Tribal communities in exchange for credit or tuition
 - Shellfish and aquaculture management and projects
 - Water quality conditions monitoring and testing
 - Ocean and climate change research and projects
 - Chesapeake Bay and associated waterways monitoring and data collection
 - Emergency response programs
 - o Establish a research lab on reservation lands with NOAA collaboration
 - Travel and capacity funding to relevant meetings and conferences, such as the Northeast Regional Ocean Council (NROC) or the North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organization (NASCO)

Capacity and Funding for NOAA Staff and Their Partners

- Dedicated Tribal engagement staffing: Interviewees noted that NOAA at times appeared to
 need more capacity to engage meaningfully with all the Tribes in the region. It was suggested
 that NOAA dedicate more office and staff resources for Tribal engagement, such as sub-regional
 Mid-Atlantic and Northeast Tribal liaisons. It was also mentioned that NOAA should hire people
 with an environmental justice background or Native staff to do this work.
- Climate change planning: It was noted that NOAA should allocate resources to helping Tribal Nations develop vulnerability assessments and climate change adaptation plans.

Coordination with Other Offices, Agencies, and Partners

- Coordinating across boundaries: For restoration and species recovery to be successful, Tribal interviewees emphasized that it is essential to view the ocean, coastal waterways, and watersheds as interconnected, despite the division of responsibility among agencies and the divides of state or international borders.
 - o For example, several Tribes are interested in anadromous fish species and their phases of life from the ocean through other waterways that pass through the boundary between fresh and salt water as well as international borders. Atlantic salmon, in particular, are not being sufficiently protected, in part due to its passage across the international border with Canada. NOAA has previously been involved in cross-border conversations with Canada and other Federal agencies on anadromous fish species restoration and could take a greater leadership role.

- o Interviewee quote: "The head of tide is seen as a barrier to the agencies. Once it hits freshwater, it becomes USFWS territory instead of NOAA. But we see it as interconnected ecosystem . . . When the resources become depleted like the groundfish, haddock, pollock, halibut, flounder those species have taken a hit. Our stories that we have been handed down to us have said there were so many before a garden of Eden. Now we live in a place where we have to go miles and miles offshore to get fish. We have to work with our trustee agencies to bring back the health of the environment so we and our neighbors can make a living and eat. It's like a marine desert in a way. We can't even subsistence fish anymore we would starve. We need it to go back to a healthy ecosystem."
- Coordination with other partners: In order to streamline efforts and alleviate the burden on Tribes of working with numerous agencies on overlapping activities, Tribal partners identified areas where there could be coordination and communication within NOAA and with States, other Federal agencies, and other partners.
 - o Interviewee quote: "[One academic institution] has multiple people from the school contacting us about all these projects they are working on, but it would be better to have one person be that point of contact. It is frustrating when they don't know who the current Chief is, and they are asking us for information." (One of the programs that engages with Tribes at this academic institution is funded by NOAA.)
 - Interviewees suggested avenues for NOAA to coordinate with other Federal agencies and other entities below:
 - o BIA Tribal Resilience program
 - Bureau of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM), particularly around offshore wind energy and mitigation of impacts to bird populations
 - Chesapeake Bay Foundation Oyster Project
 - EPA's Significant New Alternatives Policy (SNAP) Program helps Tribes and agencies network resources and research
 - The Native American Fish & Wildlife Society
 - United South and Eastern Tribes, Inc. (USET) on climate change studies, training for capacity to Tribes, establishing relationships and seeking support from Tribes, and grant support
 - USGS, particularly around coastal projects and around climate change with USGS's Northeast and Southeast Climate Adaptation Science Centers (CASC)
 - o Virginia Commonwealth University's Rice Rivers Center
- Coordination best practices: Tribal representatives mentioned the following best practices from other agencies that could benefit NOAA and their partners:
 - EPA has monthly meetings with all the Tribes in the region through the Regional Tribal Operations Committee (RTOC) calls; these are valuable for NOAA to engage in and be present/visible to Tribes.
 - The USGS CASCs have Tribal liaisons that have been doing "fantastic work." Look at the
 example of their approach and consider ways to build on the relationships that have
 been established there.
 - EPA has included climate change in their strategic plan, which has benefited Tribes through funding and planning.
 - Engagement around climate change with Institute for Tribal Environmental Professionals (ITEP), USET, USGS CASCs, and USACE.

- USACE has revamped their programs significantly to make it easier for Tribes to access funds.
- EPA has connected Tribes through Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University on water quality management.

Education and Training Opportunities

- **For Tribes:** Most Tribes did not know what services and resources NOAA could offer and would like to have a training/information sharing on their resources and opportunities for Tribes as well as their basic operations, procedures, and programs. Other specific trainings mentioned include:
 - GIS systems
 - Shoreline mapping
 - Oyster reef and aquaculture management and science
 - Climate resiliency
 - Coastal resource management
 - Marine archeology
 - Monitoring, testing, and mapping tools for watersheds and waterways such as the Chesapeake Bay and the James River
- For NOAA staff: A number of interviewees mentioned that it is important for NOAA staff to have an understanding of the history, context, and law in Indian Country, as well as an awareness of consultation requirements and how to work respectfully with Tribes. Specific suggestions included:
 - NOAA staff attorneys, law interns, and fellowship grantees should take a Federal Indian law course.
 - Have an understanding of what cultural resources mean for Tribes. For example: saltwater fishing industry has a limited catch license, but this is a way of life/subsistence for Tribes.
 - Interviewee quote: "We are a maritime-based culture. It is not our fault . . . the resources are depleted. Maybe there is a way they can open the fishery to the Tribal members without fear of penalty in outer waters that NOAA is responsible for."
 - Have an understanding that the health of the coast is really important in sustaining coastal foods for Tribal subsistence.
 - Interviewee quote: "Tribal communities may view fish, marine life not only in commerce lens, but also in sustenance lens as a right to access foods."
 - Clarify your own views on "conservation" and how that might relate to Tribal philosophy, worldview, and priorities/needs.
 - Seek to understand Tribes and the way they view the world.
 - For example: The notion of "2 eyed seeing" conveys the idea that Tribes look at world in part through Tribal way of knowing things. They look at world with an Indigenous lens and a science lens with another, recognizing that both have strengths and can help each other.
 - Interviewee quote: "The Tribe views Earth as much more spiritual. Our view on the Earth and her waters are an integral part of our culture. While political and professional development and interactions with our Tribe are appreciated and important, our connection to Mother Earth comes first."

THEMES FROM ASSESSMENT INTERVIEWS: NOAA STAFF & THEIR PARTNERS

WHAT IS WORKING WELL

Overall, NOAA staff and partners feel they have a good working relationship with the Tribes they work with, and they want to continue and enhance partnerships with Tribes as well as build new partnerships with Tribes. NOAA programs are engaging in a range of projects with Tribal partners, with a focus on education, communications, training, technical assistance, and funding of species recovery grants. There are also some projects around natural resources management, ocean planning, both joint projects and those that are Tribally led. There was an example of being present at Tribal celebrations and the desire to do that more often as appropriate. There have been some projects to learn about and disseminate information on Indigenous ways of knowing. Outlined below are specific examples of activities with Tribes in the Mid-Atlantic and New England regions:

Activities with Tribes in the Mid-Atlantic Activities with Tribes in New England Coastal Zone Management program **Emergency management** • Resilience Adaption Feasibility Tool (RAFT) Shad project River herring projects Resistive counter monitoring • Partnership with Virginia Institute of Marine Collaborative grant writing Science (VIMS) Soft shell clam projects • Data sharing agreements through the NOAA Field trips for Native and non-Office of Technology Partnerships Native youth • Museum exhibit grant for which NOAA is working Story mapping with Tribe and has provided writing expertise Sea-run fish restoration • "Heads Up" program with the National Weather Service (NWS) and Mashpee Wampanoag • Working to achieve StormReady Program

Best Practices Identified by NOAA Staff and their Partners

The following best practices identified by NOAA Staff and their partners during the assessment interviews and were also mentioned by Tribal partners in their interviews:

- Engagement of Tribes on both local projects and national policy levels is important.
- Co-ownership of a project.

recognition with the NWS

- Inviting Native people as instructors to programs.
- Maintaining regular communication with Tribal partners.
- Clarifying and making sure you hear concerns.
- Being humble and ready to learn when communicating and working with Tribal partners.
- Working with an intermediary organization that has the trust of Native Nations, such as the United South and Eastern Tribes (USET), to help build new relationships.
- Making in-person visits to the Native Nation on their territory when invited.

• Being responsive to Tribal requests and jointly building projects together that provide benefits to Tribes and build relationships for the long term.

Example Success Stories Identified by NOAA Staff and their Partners

While this is not an exhaustive list of all of the success stories NOAA staff and their partners have engaged in with Tribes, below are some examples of success stories mentioned during the group discussions:

- Recognizing Tribal presence by including each Tribe in the roll call for agency calls/meetings.
- Pamunkey Tribe provided edits to the NOAA Habitat Focus Area application.
- Paper with Pamunkey Tribe on how they view natural resources.
- Incorporating TEK and Indigenous ways of knowing into shellfish training, storymapping through GIS, and education and outreach materials (Lake Champlain origin story, ways of knowing water, cultural significance of salmon).
- Participatory mapping project with the Passamaquoddy Tribe of marine fisheries data.

OPPORTUNITIES FOR IMPROVING RELATIONSHIPS WITH TRIBAL PARTNERS

In their group discussions, NOAA staff and partners identified the ways outlined below that they could improve their working relationships with Tribal Governments throughout New England and the Mid-Atlantic. In identifying these areas for improvement, staff were speaking from their experience on specific projects with Tribes and making suggestions of practices that, while they may be occurring now in some instances, should be adopted more widely throughout the region. These ideas range from specific ideas to high-level guidance and could be a good starting point for consideration of NOAA's next steps.

Relationship Building and Communication

- When invited, attend and learn at Tribally-led meetings.
- Lead less, listen more especially in spaces that are Tribally led.
- Establish better communication channels with Tribes. Also establish informal lines of communication on the staff level outside of the formal lines of communication in government-to-government (G2G) consultation.
- Be clear about NOAA/partner requirements and limitations when engaging with Tribes. For example, clearly articulating any limitations under NOAA's mandates to help ensure productive discussions.
- Invite Tribal partners to express their concerns and needs so that NOAA and Tribal partners can align their goals. Identify shared interests between NOAA and Tribal partners. Consider why Tribes might wish to engage and ensure that NOAA is offering tangible benefits to the Tribe (e.g., funding, needed services, relevant capacity-building).
- Be sure the Tribe benefits in some way in all interactions. Work hard to identify the tribal need and benefit to interacting.
- Strive for a better understanding of Tribal priorities and ethical Indigenous engagement practices. Change to a relational mindset rather than a "transactional" mindset.
- Strive to change negative perceptions of government agencies ("We're the government and we are here to help") by ensuring NOAA's approach engages in true partnerships with Tribes that fully recognize and respect Tribal sovereignty and address issues of relevance to Tribes.

- Consider establishing Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs) with Tribal partners, such as around technical support and data sharing, which can be useful to clarify expectations for all and demonstrate respect of Tribal sovereignty.
- Set clear expectations on informal consultation and G2G consultation when consulting with Tribal partners. Clarify terms before consulting.
 - Be aware of who you are speaking with and ensure appropriate Tribal decision-making processes are followed during consultation.
- Learn about and develop appropriate land acknowledgements with the Tribal partner.
 - Some felt that they would like to have correct land acknowledgements to share during meetings.
 - Others noted that land acknowledgements, if they are used, need to be authentic and involve action at an institutional level. It is important to avoid making hollow statements.
- Follow up on the previously held NOAA Roundtables or host annual conference to encourage relationship building and participate in exchanges. For example: Host Coastal Conference on Martha's Vineyard and Nantucket.
- Develop program/project strategies in conjunction with Tribes. For example: the National Integrated Drought Information System (NIDIS) has done this with Midwestern Tribes and hired a new Tribal coordinator as part of the strategy.
- Share the success of projects with other Tribes to build trust and relationships.
- Recognize it takes time to build relationships of trust.
- Be sensitive to the implications of NOAA staff turnover and find ways to facilitate communication in existing Tribal relationships during transitions.

Capacity and Funding for Enhanced NOAA-Tribal Engagement

- Provide capacity, funding, and resources for Tribal partners to engage, recognizing this may require thinking creatively to meet Tribal needs and fit NOAA's resources and mandates:
 - Travel to meetings/conferences
 - Inter-Tribal discussions/networks on relevant issues
 - Research opportunities
 - Tribally led and owned data collection
 - Grant-writing training and assistance to Tribal partners, especially for Federal grants
 - Work directly with Tribal colleges and universities to build capacity
- Provide capacity, funding, and resources for NOAA staff and their partners to engage with Native Nations:
 - Provide funding and capacity to meet in-person or to attend meetings (if possible) with
 Tribal partners to build relationships
 - Programs/funding for binational cooperation
 - o Hire Tribal coordinator staff who are Indigenous
 - Provide technical support for Tribes, and strive for Tribal capacity building in all technical efforts

Information Sharing

This section reflects what we heard in the group discussions with NOAA staff and their partners. Findings and recommendations based on the below suggestions are outlined separately.

- Clarify with Tribal partners what opportunities are relevant and important to the Tribes so that NOAA staff and partners are not inundating the Tribes with information that is not relevant to them.
- Acknowledge there is a lack of trust from the Tribes around research and data sharing.
- Consider establishing confidentiality agreements with Tribal partners.
- Recognize there is a diversity of views and range of understanding about the importance and role of Indigenous knowledge for NOAA programs/projects among NOAA staff.
 - A couple interviewees mentioned that traditional knowledge is not applicable in the modern context and did not see a role for it in NOAA's work.
 - It was noted that there can be difficulties in reconciling agency/Tribal data when they diverge.
 - Others thought it was important to seek ways to support Tribes and overcome obstacles to the integration of Indigenous knowledge in NOAA programs/projects, such as weather and climate change programs.
 - For example: NWS creation of a coastal flooding impacts catalogue in Alaska that included Indigenous knowledge.
 - Another example: To frame its research competition, NIDIS started a dialogue around drought from the perspective of Tribes, which was very effective in helping to weave together Indigenous knowledge and Western science perspectives.
- Engage with Tribes around specific topics with a Tribal lens, such as issues of climate or drought.
 Other topics include:
 - o Ocean floor mapping, what's been done and what could be done that is Tribally led.
 - o Information-sharing and learning about marine resources from Tribal Nations.
- Develop an updated list of Federally-recognized Tribes, State-recognized Tribes, relocated
 Tribes, and who's the right person to contact at the Tribe. For example: FEMA Region 1 keeps a
 list of latest Tribal Nations and representatives.
- Develop a one-pager on what different NOAA offices can offer to share with Tribes.
- Identify Tribally-approved maps of homelands, relocated Tribes, and, to the extent the Tribe has agreed to publicly share the information, any cultural resources.

Internal NOAA Coordination and Policy Clarification

- Develop a regional strategy for Tribal engagement in coordination with Tribal partners.
- Identify and better coordinate overlaps in communication and outreach with Tribes among NOAA line offices (e.g., NOS and Fisheries; weather and ecosystems). Each program or line office has their own authorities and are not communicating across programs/line offices about their Tribal engagement. Strive to have one NOAA voice when communicating with Tribal partners.
 - In particular, interviewees mentioned that the National Weather Service (NWS) did not seem well connected to the other LOs, but that there would be value in working together on Tribal outreach because of NWS's connections to Tribes.
 - o Increase communication between the NOAA National Tribal Relations Team and the rest of the NOAA staff.

- Identify existing Tribal connections among NOAA staff and explore ways to support each other in making connections and building new relationships.
 - Break down barriers (funding, legal, policy, contracting, etc.) to working with Tribes.
 There have been issues with agency programs not fully understanding how to contract with Tribes effectively.
 - There are watershed systems and marine life important to Tribes that cross borders.
 Consider opportunities to work more holistically and across borders to meet Tribal needs.
 - For example: working further upstream on issues such as impacts to sea-run fish.
 - Another example: supporting programs and providing funding for bi-national cooperation on the St. John and St. Croix Rivers.
 - Be aware there can be longstanding tensions between States and Tribal Governments and States may not be willing to have equal Tribal participation.
 - Recognize that the classifications of Tribes (State-recognized or Federally recognized)
 can determine whether they can engage or be funded for a certain process, program, or
 project.
 - Find opportunities to facilitate inclusion of State-recognized Tribes, recognizing that State partners are required to work with them and creating a tiered relationship is problematic.
 - Clarify jurisdictional issues related to State recognition. For example: Federally recognized Tribes are not in the Virginia Code and Tribes have to establish foundations in order to do the work, leading to numerous legal issues.
 - Clarify any agency legal issues or barriers related to data confidentiality when working with Tribes.
 - Provide guidance on providing compensation to Tribal representatives.
 - Develop cooperative partner agreements to do work with Tribes, Tribal organizations and partner organizations, such as the NOAA Office of Technology Partnerships has done.
 - Clarify agency policies and approaches to environmental justice and how they fit (or don't) with Tribal consultation.

Coordination with Other Offices, Agencies, and Partners

- In terms of partners on projects involving Tribes, NOAA most frequently engages with educational institutions and State environmental or natural resource and fisheries agencies.
- There is some partnering with Federal agencies; EPA most often mentioned.
- NOAA staff also participate in some multi-jurisdictional, multi-agency partnerships such as the Northeast Regional Ocean Council (NROC) and the Gulf of Maine Council.
- NOAA staff and partners believe there should be more coordination and communication within NOAA and with States, other Federal agencies, and partners around working with Tribes in the region. Suggestions of ways to do that included:
 - Hold forums/meetings to better coordinate between States, Federal government, and Tribal Nations. Build upon existing networks to do this work.
 - Partner with universities and colleges that can provide opportunities to Tribes or have relationships with Tribes. For example, NIDIS has worked with Tribal universities and colleges to identify priorities and then provide funding for research on drought. Also,

- Sea Grant programs are already working in these spaces and could help coordinate these opportunities.
- Improve communication and coordination within NOAA and with their partners on projects and programs so that there is information sharing about Tribal projects. This can address capacity issues.
 - Develop a message board or dashboard with information and opportunities across NOAA and their partners to share with Tribal partners.
 - Develop tracker of formal consultation processes across Federal agency partners.
- Other specific suggestions of partnerships to engage in are as follows:
 - Maine Intertribal Council
 - Hurricane Zoom Meeting for staff and Tribal representatives and members could also include FEMA and states.
 - o "Know Your Zone" program
 - Red Cross or emergency programs
 - Utility company that serves the Tribe
 - Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA)

Education and Training Topics for NOAA Staff and their Partners

- Awareness and learning of Tribal histories.
- Cultural sensitivity training for NOAA staff and their partners.
- Trainings on working with Native Nations for NOAA staff and their partners. For example, USDA
 NRCS and the Udall Foundation have trainings on working with Native communities.
- Understanding of who has Tribal authority to speak on behalf of the Tribe.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

FINDINGS

Drawing on what we heard in both the group interviews with NOAA staff and partner organizations and the individual interviews with Tribal representatives, NCECR identified the following key takeaways:

- Some positive relationships but limited Tribal awareness of NOAA: NOAA staff that we spoke with represented a self-selected group, many of whom work regularly with Tribes, while others had less interaction but were interested in learning how to work better with them. Those staff who worked with Tribes generally felt they had built good relationships while recognizing there was more work to be done and that some relationships were only in their initial stages. On the Tribal side, there were a few Tribes who had frequent interaction with NOAA and generally felt there were good working relationships on those projects. Most Tribal representatives, however, reported limited interaction with NOAA and knowledge about NOAA programs. Even those who work frequently with NOAA said they did not have a good knowledge of the breadth of NOAA's work and felt there could be many more opportunities to work together. Tribal interviewees expressed a desire to learn more and explore areas of common interest that could support Tribal priorities and needs.
- Range of NOAA staff experience and little inter-office coordination: NOAA staff participating in the interviews had a range of experience in working with Tribes. Some had engaged in quite indepth work and built longstanding relationships over time and were able to share valuable takeaways from their experiences. Other staff were newer to working with Tribes and were unfamiliar with the protocols of working with sovereign Tribal Governments. Staff did not seem familiar with each other's experiences in working with Tribes across line offices (LOs) and welcomed the opportunity to share learnings, knowledge, and explore shared questions in the group interviews. They expressed the desire to continue the dialogue among LOs.
- Importance of building a Government-to-Government (G2G) relationship Given the concerns expressed by some Tribal interviewees about insufficient consultation and/or NOAA's approach to decision-making involving East Coast Tribes, there is a need to build a knowledge and understanding among all NOAA regional staff who interact with Tribes about their Federal trust responsibilities towards Native Nations in the context of the G2G relationship. It is essential to recognize that each Native Nation is an individual and unique sovereign government and that has its own processes, protocols, needs, and priorities. A generalized approach is not sufficient, nor can it be assumed that approaches that work for larger Tribes or those with established treaties, such as some West Coast Tribes, would be applicable to those in the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic regions. Furthermore, each Tribe has a unique relationship and history with their neighboring State governments and each other. The Federal government relationship and actions should be cognizant of these unique differences in implementing protocols, procedures, and policies.
- Need for NOAA regional/headquarters coordination on Tribal outreach: Among Tribes who
 worked more frequently with NOAA staff, representatives often expressed an appreciation for
 the individual regional NOAA staff they worked with but noted that those regional staff often

seemed limited in how much they could support Tribal priorities. Tribal representatives had the impression that regional staff were not supported by NOAA headquarters or consistent NOAA policy in their efforts to work with Tribes or meet Tribal needs. Some high-priority Tribal initiatives, such as anadromous fish restoration, call for working across boundaries between salt and fresh waters, the missions of different Federal agencies, and even international borders — which requires internal NOAA coordination, supportive policies, and taking a leadership role.

- Need for intra- and inter-agency coordination: Both NOAA and Tribal interviewees pointed to
 the fact that multiple, overlapping, and competing requests for engagement from various
 agencies and entities and even from within the same organization can pose a significant
 burden on Tribes, who may have one or a few staff handling many issue areas. They identified a
 need not only for NOAA to coordinate better internally ("one NOAA voice"), but also for NOAA
 to coordinate with Federal, State, and other partners on communication around common or
 overlapping efforts.
- Significant opportunities and common areas of interest: Tribal representatives and NOAA staff
 alike generated many ideas for potential areas where they could potentially work together and
 expressed interest and enthusiasm about finding more and better ways to do so. There is a
 sense that investing the resources to engage in dialogue between Tribes and NOAA regional
 representatives could yield many benefits in terms of mutual learning, creative projects that
 fulfill the priorities of both partners, and stronger, enduring relationships.

NCECR RECOMMENDATIONS

Building on themes heard from interviewees, the National Center for Environmental Conflict Resolution (NCECR) offers the following overarching recommendations for NOAA staff in the North Atlantic region. There are a number of specific recommendations supporting these broad recommendations that can be found in the summaries of the Tribal and NOAA staff interviews. We encourage NOAA staff to refer to these specific recommendations when developing a regional strategy.

- Develop a regional strategy for Tribal engagement, while being attentive to larger geographic
 connections in recognition of the fact that Native Nations do not necessarily view their
 environmental, natural, and cultural resource challenges as falling within NOAA's geographic or
 programmatic divisions.
 - Enhance coordination and information-sharing among NOAA line offices (LO) in the North Atlantic region to ensure a cohesive, coordinated approach to Tribal outreach and break down silos between the different LOs.
 - Create regular opportunities for NOAA staff across LOs and programs who are working with Tribes to share learnings, opportunities, and resources.
 - O Include mechanisms to engage HQ staff and leadership in the work of the region to allow for dialogue around coordination of policies and priorities and bringing needed resources to bear. This HQ/regional dialogue should seek ways to align NOAA policies and resource allocations to consistently support NOAA staff in working effectively with Native Nations to meet their needs within the areas of NOAA's mission.
 - Develop internal information-sharing strategies around regional work with Native
 Nations to facilitate sharing across LOs as well as help onboard new staff and minimize

- the loss of knowledge and relationships due to staff turnover. This could begin with a simple tracking spreadsheet or database that NOAA staff across LOs can access.
- Include in outreach planning those Federally recognized Tribes who are not located on the coast but may have an interest in coastal and ocean issues due to their traditional homelands and hunting/fishing areas or have an interest in watershed-wide ecosystem protection and restoration.
- Include State-recognized Tribes in outreach plans when their interests may be affected, and particularly when partnering with States.

• Invest time and resources in building individual, government-to-government relationships with Tribes in New England and the Mid-Atlantic on an ongoing basis.

- In coordination across NOAA LOs, seek to hold meetings with each Tribe to gain an understanding of the priorities and needs of each Tribe in order to build productive relationships, identify ways to support Tribal priorities within NOAA's mission, and better tailor the information/opportunities shared with them. If possible, hold meetings in person on Tribal lands. When meeting with Tribal leadership, seek to bring NOAA HQ staff or leadership to the meeting.
- Prioritize staff workload and investment in staff to successfully build and maintain respectful, culturally sensitive relationships with Tribes. This type of ongoing communication takes time and effort to develop.
- Consider increasing Tribal liaison staffing to allow for regular, sustained outreach to all Native Nations in the region.
- Acknowledge any past NOAA actions that may have created tension in relationships with East Coast Tribes, such as the COVID-19 funding allocations, and identify ways to prevent similar issues in regional relationships in the future.
- When engaging in formal G2G consultation with Tribes on a proposed action, be sure to:
 - Engage the Tribe as early as possible in the decision-making process
 - Work with appropriate contacts to be aware of the Tribe's protocols and decision-making processes
 - Clarify expectations for the consultation on both sides
 - Identify and address any confidentiality concerns early on in the process
 - Engage in two-way dialogue and listening during the consultation
 - Follow up on the consultation in a timely manner
 - Keep the Tribe updated as decision-making progresses

• **Engage in a two-way information exchange** with Tribal partners.

- Develop an accessible document that clearly explains the different NOAA offices, their roles, and example activities with Tribes in the region, along with staff contact information. Make this information on NOAA programs/projects in partnership with Tribes easily accessible on NOAA website.
- Based on relationships built in individual meetings about Tribal priorities and needs,
 provide accessible information and funding opportunities that are responsive to Tribal

priorities, perhaps in coordination with other agency partners. Some particular areas of interest to Tribes include climate change impacts and water quality information.

- An example of accessible water quality information is EPA's How's My
 Waterway website: https://mywaterway.epa.gov/. It includes estuaries, but not coastal waters unless the State has done assessments.
- Engage with Tribes in ongoing dialogue to understand the value of Indigenous knowledge, identify ways it can be integrated into projects and data collection, and build an early awareness into project planning. The dialogue should also include the concept of data sovereignty and explore ways to weave together Indigenous knowledge and Western science while honoring Tribal data sovereignty and confidentiality needs.⁶
- Keep a Tribal contact list for NOAA staff; develop a NOAA staff contact list for Tribes.
- Find ways to support Tribal capacity and priority programs, either within NOAA or in coordination with other agencies and entities. Given limitations on some Federal funding opportunities, this may call for creative thinking and/or working across boundaries between offices, agencies, and regions.

Funding for Tribes

- Develop a resource document of available funding sources for Tribes, both within NOAA and at other agencies, to help them identify ways to fund their programs.⁷
- Work across NOAA offices to coordinate on funding opportunities, making them more relevant to Tribal needs and making them more responsive to Tribal capacity and staffing needs. It is important to recognize that many Tribes do not have the staffing resources to devote to applying through competitive grant processes or maintaining grants. NOAA's National Integrated Drought Information System (NIDIS) grant program could be a resource in this effort.
- Seek ways to provide core funding for Tribal programs to provide continuity, consistency, and the ability to maintain a program and staff. This may be most effective to do in coordination with other agencies that have areas of overlap with NOAA's mission and activities, such as EPA, USFWS, USGS, and BIA. EPA is also discussing this concept and connecting with EPA staff could be a good starting point.⁸
- Identify more effective approaches to contracting directly with and/or funding Tribes, such as the cooperative partner agreements developed by the NOAA Office of Technology Partnerships.
- Provide funding to support Tribal capacity to collect their own data in areas of importance to them that may be affected by Federal decision-making processes, such as the siting of offshore wind facilities. Tribes should control their own data and determine the format and content of any data to be shared with others.

⁶ One example of a similar dialogue taking place is at EPA's Office of Environmental Justice: https://www.epa.gov/environmentaljustice/environmental-justice-tribes-and-indigenous-peoples

⁷ EPA has developed a sample compilation of potential Tribal funding sources here:\ 1 Background\EPA Funding Sources Compilation.pdf.

⁸ During the presentation of this report during the 11/10/21 EPA Region 1 RTOC call, participants suggested building on EPA's Performance Partnerships Grants program, which offers a way to combine funding from multiple grants, as well as exploring opportunities offered through the Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act, which includes funding for salmon recovery, and the Recovering America's Wildlife Act (introduced in Congress in April 2021).

 Provide travel funding assistance to allow Tribal representatives to travel to meetings and allow their voice to be heard in relevant decision-making processes, such as the Northeast Regional Ocean Council (NROC) or the North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organization (NASCO).

Data Management, Collection, Analysis

- o When creating a database, consult Tribes on the information to be collected.
- Create cooperative databases of existing data, accessible to Tribes. Include processes to protect and respect Tribal data, incorporating concepts of data sovereignty.
- Provide support in analysis of project impacts to Tribal lands and compensation for Tribal THPO and staff for impact analysis of projects.
- Provide training in data review, GIS use, and analysis for Federal agency environmental review requests.

Training for Tribes

- Provide ongoing opportunities and resources for technical learning around Tribal interests and needs. This could include regular webinar series, topic overview recordings available online, periodic substantive highlights in Tribal outreach emails, opportunities on joint research efforts, etc. Periodically ask for and respond to Tribal input on both substantive areas of interest for further learning and feedback on ongoing efforts.
- Ensure all NOAA regional staff are adequately trained on engaging with Native Nations and the importance and relevance of Indigenous knowledge to NOAA's work; offer opportunities frequently to account for staff turnover.
 - When available, attend Tribally led trainings allowing for utilization of oral traditions and other forms of conveying Tribal traditions, knowledge, and wisdom. Tribal representatives should be involved in the development and delivery of trainings.
 - Supervisors and leadership actively share training resources, provide funds, and encourage their staff to attend trainings.
 - Learn about the Tribes the agency is engaging with before meeting with them. This can include site visits, research, and trainings; for example, visiting local tribal museums (e.g., the Mashantucket Pequot Museum).
 - Consider incorporating knowledge and ability to work effectively with Tribes into competencies for all staff positions that will have interaction with Tribal representatives.
- Reach out to other agencies and entities to improve coordination and build on areas of
 overlapping interests and activities to better support Tribal partners in a more streamlined
 fashion. Tribal representatives can be inundated with an influx of information from multiple
 partners (Federal, State, academic, etc.), often on similar or overlapping issues. Federal agencies
 should make an effort to coordinate and streamline their efforts with other entities to alleviate
 the burden on Tribes, as well as maximize resources and efficiency.
 - Begin building partnerships and identifying areas of coordination with other Federal agencies with complementary or overlapping work in areas that are relevant to Tribal partners. In particular, EPA, USFWS, the USGS NE and SE Climate Adaptation Science Centers, BOEM, and BIA emerged as important places to start.

- Develop inter-agency mechanisms to communicate and coordinate to share information, opportunities for Tribes, and shared learning opportunities. In particular, agencies should seek to coordinate around grant and funding opportunities for Tribes as mentioned above.
- Engage with relevant inter-Tribal organizations to identify areas of common interest and communication pathways, such as the United Southern and Eastern Tribes (USET)
 Natural Resources Committee and the Institute for Tribal Environmental Professionals (ITEP).
- Attend and be visible at relevant regional meetings with Tribes and the EPA's Regional Tribal Operations Committee (RTOC) meetings in particular, while recognizing that such meetings are important but not sufficient for NOAA's engagement with Tribes due to the many entities present and variety of topics covered. NOAA may explore with Tribal partners whether it would be valuable to host regional Tribally led annual summits or roundtables or more frequent quarterly calls.
- Take a Federal leadership (or co-leadership) role in areas that fall within NOAA's mission and align with Tribal priorities.
 - NOAA regional staff could work with HQ staff and leadership on ways to identify and overcome institutional barriers to supporting high-priority efforts to recover anadromous fish species.
 - Consider supporting greater collaboration around the recovery of Atlantic salmon across agencies and the international border. The recovery of anadromous fish species is a high priority for Tribal partners and these efforts could benefit from greater leadership from NOAA and investment of resources in collaboration.
 - Work with partners at other agencies to participate in inter-agency dialogues on the recovery of other culturally important anadromous fish species, including American eel and alewives.
 - Consider taking a leadership role in hosting dialogues among Tribes and Federal and State agency partners around the integration of Indigenous knowledge and Tribal data into Federal decision-making processes. The dialogue should also include the concept of data sovereignty and explore ways to weave together Indigenous knowledge and Western science while honoring Tribal data sovereignty and confidentiality needs.
- Follow through on the results of this assessment and keep Tribes updated on next steps. Tribal representatives participating in the assessment expressed interest in seeing NOAA follow through with next steps and a desire to see what comes of this assessment.

The Udall team is grateful to all the interviewees who dedicated their time and energy to talking with us. We hope the results of this assessment will help NOAA staff, their partners, and Tribes in the region to build upon existing partnerships to create valuable, productive, and enduring relationships that meet the needs and priorities of Native Nations and Federal agencies alike.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: List of Tribal Representatives Interviewed

- Aroostook Band of MicMacs
 - o Cara O'Donnell, Natural Resource Director
- Chickahominy Indian Tribe
 - o Dana Adkins, Tribal Environmental Director
- Chickahominy Indian Tribe Eastern Division
 - Jessica Phillips, Tribal Environmental Director
- Houlton Band of Maliseet Indians
 - Sharri Venno, Environmental Planner
 - Susan Young, Natural Resource Director
- Mashantucket Pequot Tribal Nation
 - o Michael Kickingbear Johnson, Deputy Tribal Historic Preservation Officer
- Mashpee Wampanoag Tribe
 - Jason Steiding, Natural Resources Director
 - o Dale Oakley, Assistant Director of Natural Resources
- Monacan Indian Nation
 - Chief Kenneth Branham
 - o Kaleigh Pollak, Program Manager
- Nansemond Indian Tribe
 - o Keith Anderson, Environmental Program Director
- Passamaquoddy Pleasant Point
 - o Ed Bassett, Environmental Technician
 - o Marvin Cling, Environmental Planner
- Penobscot Nation
 - o Dan McCaw, Fisheries Program Manager
- Rappahannock Tribe, Inc.
 - o Woodie Walker, Director, Department of Environmental Services
- Shinnecock Indian Nation
 - Dr. Kelsey Leonard, Scientist/Representative for Mid-Atlantic Committee on the Ocean (MACO)
 - Shavonne Smith, Environmental Department Director
- United South and Eastern Tribes, Inc. (USET)
 - o Dr. Casey Thornbrugh, NE & SE Tribal Climate Science Liaison
- Upper Mattaponi Tribe
 - o Reggie Tupponce, Tribal Administrator
 - o Leigh Mitchell, Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Coordinator

APPENDIX B: List of NOAA Staff & Their Partners Interviewed

Name	Office
Elizabeth Andrews	William & Mary Law School's Virginia Coastal Policy Center
Christopher	Maine Sea Grant
Bartlett	
Nicole Bartlett	NOAA/North Atlantic Regional Team (NART)
Erik Chapman	New Hampshire (NH) Sea Grant
Glenn Field	NOAA/National Weather Service (NWS)/Weather Forecast Offices (WFO)/Boston
Darlene Finch	NOAA/Office of Coastal Management
Louise Fode	NOAA/National Weather Service (NWS)/Caribou, Maine
Simeon Hahn	NOAA/Office of Response and Restoration
Ellen Keane	NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries
	Office (GARFO)
Jake Kritzer	Northeastern Regional Association of Coastal Ocean Observing Systems
	(NERACOOS)
Gerhard Kuska	Mid-Atlantic Regional Association Coastal Ocean Observing System (MARACOOS)
Andrew Larkin	NOAA/Chesapeake Bay Office (CBO)
Tod Leighfield	NOAA/National Ocean Service (NOS)/National Centers for Coastal Ocean
	Science/Stressor Detection & Impacts Division
Catalina Martinez	NOAA/Office of Ocean Exploration and Research (OER)
Ellen Mecray	NOAA/National Environmental Satellite, Data, and Information Service
	(NESDIS)/National Centers for Environmental Information (NCEI)/Center for
	Weather and Climate (CWC)
Margaret Miller	NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Office of Protected Resources
	(OPR)
Gray Montrose	William & Mary Law School's Virginia Coastal Policy Center
Andy Nash	NOAA/National Weather Service (NWS)/Boston
Betsy Nicholson	NOAA/National Ocean Service (NOS)/Office of Coastal Management (OCM)
Sylvia Reeves	Contractor for NOAA/NIDIS - Office of Oceanic and Atmospheric Research
	(OAR)/Climate Program Office (CPO)/National Integrated Drought Information
	System (NIDIS)
Rebecca Shuford	New York (NY) Sea Grant
Grace Simpkins	Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution (WHOI) Sea Grant
Kris Stepenuck	Lake Champlain (VT & NY) Sea Grant
Rob Vincent	Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) Sea Grant
Gayle Zydlewski	Maine (ME) Sea Grant

NOAA LINE OFFICES

14 participants; 5 Line Offices; 12 distinct programs/offices

NOAA MARINE FISHERIES SERVICE (NMFS)

- 1. NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO)/Protected Resources (PR)
- 2. NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Office of Protected Resources (OPR)
- 3. NOAA/ National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/ Office of Habitat Conservation/Chesapeake Bay Office (CBO)
- 4. NOAA/North Atlantic Regional Team (NART) Participant is from NMFS

NATIONAL OCEAN SERVICE (NOS)

- NOAA/National Ocean Service (NOS)/National Centers for Coastal Ocean Science/Stressor Detection & Impacts
 Division
- 2. NOAA/National Ocean Service (NOS)/Office of Coastal Management (OCM) (2 participants)
- 3. NOAA/National Ocean Service (NOS)/Office of Response and Restoration (OR&R)

OFFICE OF OCEANIC AND ATMOSPHERIC RESEARCH (OAR)

- Contractor for NOAA/NIDIS Office of Oceanic and Atmospheric Research (OAR)/Climate Program Office (CPO)/National Integrated Drought Information System (NIDIS)
- 2. NOAA/Office of Ocean Exploration and Research (OER)

NATIONAL WEATHER SERVICE (NWS)

- 1. NOAA/National Weather Service (NWS)/Boston (2 participants)
- 2. NOAA/National Weather Service (NWS)/Caribou, Maine

NATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL SATELLITE, DATA, AND INFORMATION SERVICE (NESDIS)

 NOAA/National Environmental Satellite, Data, and Information Service (NESDIS)/National Centers for Environmental Information (NCEI)/Center for Weather and Climate (CWC)

SEA GRANT

7 participants; 6 Sea Grant Programs

- 1. Maine (ME) Sea Grant (2 participants)
- 2. New Hampshire (NH) Sea Grant
- 3. New York (NY) Sea Grant
- 4. Lake Champlain (VT & NY) Sea Grant
- 5. Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution (WHOI) Sea Grant
- 6. Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) Sea Grant

PARTNERS

4 participants; 3 partner organizations

- 1. William & Mary Law School's Virginia Coastal Policy Center (2 participants)
- 2. Northeastern Regional Association of Coastal Ocean Observing Systems (NERACOOS)
- 3. Mid-Atlantic Regional Association Coastal Ocean Observing System (MARACOOS)

APPENDIX C: List of Guiding Questions for Tribal Representatives

We will use these questions as a guide but may tailor them depending on the areas of importance that emerge in our conversation with you.

- 1. (If applicable) How familiar are you with the activities NOAA has engaged in with your Tribal Government? What has been your role with regard to those activities?
- 2. What are your Tribal Government's needs and priorities with regard to the areas within NOAA's mission, such as conservation and management of ocean and coastal resources? Relating to information and preparation for climate conditions and weather events?
- 3. Are there opportunities for NOAA to support these priorities and needs within the areas of its mission?
- 4. What has been valuable or beneficial to your Tribal Government about the activities with NOAA? (Or if none looking at the list of projects that NOAA has engaged in with other Tribal Governments in the region, do you see any activities that would be valuable or beneficial to your Tribal Government?)
- 5. What obstacles or challenges have there been in your work with NOAA? (Or what barriers or obstacles do you see to working with NOAA?)
- 6. Are there ways that NOAA could improve its ocean/coastal/weather/climate-related services to your Tribal Government?
- 7. Do you see opportunities for NOAA to better coordinate with your Tribal Government? Do you have any recommendations to improve NOAA's outreach and coordination with your Tribal Government?
- 8. Do you see opportunities for NOAA to better coordinate with other entities in working with you (e.g., state agencies, universities, other federal agencies)?
- 9. What role, if any, can NOAA play in improving intra or inter-agency coordination with you?
- 10. What information, knowledge, capacity, or training do you feel NOAA staff need in their interactions with your Tribal Government?
- 11. Is there information, knowledge, capacity-building, or training that you would like NOAA to offer to your Tribal Government?
- 12. We have interviewed NOAA staff and are doing outreach for interviews to the federally recognized Tribal Governments in the New England and Mid-Atlantic regions. Is there anyone else you think we should talk to in order to get a full picture for this assessment?
- 13. Is there anything we haven't covered that you think is important to mention for this assessment?

APPENDIX D: List of Guiding Questions for NOAA Staff & Their Partners

Relationships with Tribes in the North Atlantic

- 1. Do you have any comments on or corrections to what we have gathered so far?
- 2. From your perspective, why is it important for the agency to engage with Tribes?
- 3. What would you need to build improved relationships with Tribal partners?
- 4. Are there Tribes in the region you have not yet engaged with that you would like to reach out to? If so, what has prevented you from engaging with them?
- 5. What has helped or allowed you to build good relationships with Tribes?

Activities with Tribes in the North Atlantic

- 6. In your work with Tribes, how has the need for the activity been identified and decided upon? Have Tribes made requests of you for particular services or activities?
- 7. How is Tribal input incorporated into decision making? What programs or decisions have changed as result of Tribal input?
- 8. How would you characterize Tribal participation in NOAA activities (significant, frequent, intermittent, minimal, etc.)?
- 9. What do you see as the barriers to Tribal participation? Have you been able to address those? Why or why not?
- 10. How have you incorporated indigenous ways of knowing or TEK into your programs?
- 11. Have you been able to share learnings about Indigenous ways of knowing internally with other NOAA programs? If so, how?

Partnering with Other Offices and Agencies

- 12. Do you see opportunities to partner with other agencies or offices on your projects that you haven't been able to take advantage of yet? If so, why not?
- 13. What information, services, or resources does your office have with regard to working with Tribes that you might be able to share with other NOAA offices or other agencies?
- 14. What obstacles do you see to partnering with other offices or agencies?
- 15. Have there been other Tribal assessments or strategies developed within your programs that would be helpful for us to look at?

APPENDIX E: List of Tribes and NOAA Projects/Programs

NOAA Mission

The National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's (NOAA) mission is to understand and predict changes in climate, weather, oceans, and coasts, to share that knowledge and information with others, and to conserve and manage coastal and marine ecosystems and resources. The following is a list of projects that Tribes in the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic regions have engaged in with NOAA offices. This list is not exhaustive and is intended to be used as a reference point for assessment project interviews.

Connecticut

Tribe	NOAA Offices Interacted With	Programs Involved In
Mashantucket Pequot	 NOAA/National Marine 	 Participated in the EPA New
Tribe	<u>Fisheries Service</u>	England Tribal Conference.
	(NMFS)/Greater Atlantic	
	Fisheries Office (GARFO)	
Mohegan Tribe of Indians	 NOAA/National Marine 	 Participated in the EPA New
of Connecticut	Fisheries Service	England Tribal Conference.
	(NMFS)/Greater Atlantic	
	Fisheries Office (GARFO)	

Maine

Tribe	NOAA Offices Interacted With	Programs Involved In
Aroostook Band of Micmac Indians	NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) National Weather Service - Caribou Forecast Office	 Participated in the EPA New England Tribal Conference. GARFO is currently working on networking Aroostook Band of Micmac Indians with aquaculture partners. Participated in a NWS lightning safety education and was designated a Weather-Ready Nation Ambassador in 2019. Assisted in a joint project with the University of Maine and the NWS for CREST snow surveys.
Houlton Band of Maliseet Indians	 Northeastern Regional Association of Coastal Ocean Observing Systems (NERACOOS) NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service 	 Participated in the EPA New England Tribal Conference. GARFO provides technical support for the Wolastoq/St. John partnership. GARFO provided monofilament recycling bins

⁹ To learn more about NOAA, please visit the website.

	(NMFS)/Greater Atlantic	as part of their marine
	Fisheries Office (GARFO)	debris reduction initiatives.
		 NERACOOS has interacted
		with the Tribe through the
		Gulf of Maine Council.
		Begun initial discussion
		about shared interests in
		interactions between the
		Wolastoq/St. John River and
		the Gulf of Maine.
Passamaquoddy Indian	 <u>NOAA/National Marine</u> 	GARFO works together with
Township reservation	Fisheries Service	Tribes on fish passage on the
	(NMFS)/Greater Atlantic	St. Croix. Have statement of
	Fisheries Office (GARFO)	cooperation with several
		federal partners and the
		Passamaquoddy Tribe,
		Pleasant Point and
		Passamaquoddy Tribe,
		Indian Township. Working on amendment to the
		statement to include
		Canadian federal agencies,
		First Nation, and the State of
		Maine.
		Participated in the EPA
		Tribal Environmental
		Conference (Fall 2016).
Passamaquoddy Pleasant	NOAA/National Marine	GARFO works together on
Point Reservation	Fisheries Service	fish passage on the St. Croix.
	(NMFS)/Greater Atlantic	Have statement of
	Fisheries Office (GARFO)	cooperation with several
	 Northeastern Regional 	federal partners and the
	Association of Coastal Ocean	Passamaquoddy Tribe,
	Observing Systems	Pleasant Point and
	(NERACOOS)	Passamaquoddy Tribe,
	 National Weather Service - 	Indian Township. Working
	Caribou Forecast Office	on amendment to the
		statement to include
		Canadian federal agencies,
		First Nations, and the State
		of Maine.
		NERACOOS is working with the Tribe and the Maine
		the Tribe and the Maine Center for Coastal Fisheries
		to begin new observing work
		in the lower Skutik/St. Croix
		River later this year.
		Participated in the EPA
		Tribal Environmental
		Conference (Fall 2016).
		Comerciale (i all 2010).

		 Collaborated on a coastal flooding evaluation with NWS in 2014.
Penobscot Nation	 NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Office of Protected Resources (OPR) 	 Participated in the EPA New England Tribal Conference. GARFO partners in the Atlantic Salmon Conservation Management Strategy (https://atlanticsalmonresto ration.org/cms) Participates with GARFO in education and outreach with students. Currently has a NOAA Species Recovery Grant for an "Atlantic Salmon Management and Outreach Project" with the National Marine Fisheries Service's (NMFS) Office of Protected Resources (OPR). Penobscot Nation has previously participated as part of the U.S. delegation to North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organization meetings (an international body). GARFO Maine field office has hosted several Wabanaki Youth in Science (WaYS) interns.

Massachusetts

Tribe	NOAA Offices Interacted With	Programs Involved In
Mashpee Wampanoag	 Massachusetts Institute of 	EPA New England Tribal
Tribe	Technology (MIT) Sea Grant	Conference
	 NOAA/National Marine Fisheries 	 MIT Sea Grant is
	Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic	working with the Tribe
	Fisheries Office (GARFO)	on the following topics:
	 NOAA/National Weather Service 	Fisheries (river herring);
	(NWS) (NWS)/Weather Forecast	education and citizen
	Offices (WFO)/Boston	science programs (1)
	 Stellwagen Bank National Marine 	Santuit Pond river
	<u>Sanctuary</u>	herring fish passage and
		monitoring project; (2)

NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Office of Protected Resources (OPR)	Discussing and planning education and outreach programs and collaborations; (3) Mashpee Wampanoag Tribe Preserve Our Heritage (POH) summer camp program; (4) discussing aquaculture activities, needs, networking and collaborations with the tribe. • Had a NOAA Species Recovery Grant for restoration of the Santuit River with the National Marine Fisheries Service's (NMFS) Office of Protected Resources (OPR). • GARFO provided letters of support for certain funding opportunities. • GARFO participates in the Preserving Our Homelands Camp each year. • NMFS Habitat Restoration Division has partnered with the Tribe on annual Plymouth River events. • In 2018, NWS delivered winter weather presentation at their headquarters in Mashpee. • In 2019, NWS WFO BOX provided DSS support (event briefing package)
	for the Mashpee Wampanoag Tribal Elections. • Attended NWS

emergency management conference calls.

		 NWS outreach coordinator has also provided portable weather station and presentations for Preserve Our Homelands Science Camp for teens in summer 2017-19. Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary has hosted the 3rd Annual Ocean Exploration Day for Mashpee Wampanoag Tribe's Preserving Our Homelands Summer Camp - 15 middle school students, their counselors, Culture Keeper, and Education Coordinator visited Stellwagen's home base
		counselors, Culture Keeper, and Education Coordinator visited
<u> </u>		Tribal Environmental Conference (Fall 2016).
Wampanoag Tribe of Gay Head (Aquinnah) of Massachusetts	 Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) Sea Grant NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary 	 MIT Sea Grant worked with the Tribe on the following topics: EPA Blue Carbon eelgrass habitat project and MA Division of Marine Fisheries shellfish mapping project. GARFO is working with the Tribe to develop a Marine Mammal Stranding Agreement. GARFO has provided stranding response training to the Tribe.
		GARFO has discussed coordinated outreach opportunities once the stranding agreement is in place. GARFO has engaged in discussions on cultural use of

	marine mammal sea
	turtle parts.

New York¹⁰

Tribe	NOAA Offices Interacted With	Programs Involved In
Shinnecock Indian Nation	 NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) Mid-Atlantic Regional Association Coastal Ocean Observing System (MARACOOS) NOAA's Office for Coastal Management NOAA/North Atlantic Regional Team (NART) 	 GARFO hosted a table at the Tribe's Nipi Kesuk water day. GARFO worked with the Tribe to facilitate cultural ceremonies at marine mammal stranding events and to transfer marine mammal and sea turtle parts to the Tribe. GARFO engaged in discussions with Shinnecock Global Solutions on fishing in federal waters. Shinnecock has been represented on the Mid-Atlantic Committee on the Ocean for the several years, and prior to that to the Mid-Atlantic Regional Planning Body. Participated in the NOAA/Shinnecock Roundtables.

Rhode Island

Tribe	NOAA Offices Interacted With	Programs Involved In
Narragansett Indian Tribe	 NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) 	EPA New England Tribal Conference

Virginia

Tribe	NOAA Offices Interacted With	Programs Involved In
Chickahominy Indian	NOAA/National Marine Fisheries	 Sent letter of
Tribe	Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic	introduction from GARFO
	Fisheries Office (GARFO)	Regional Administrator

¹⁰ Given the geographic focus of this assessment, only New England/Mid-Atlantic Tribes with ocean and coastal resources are included.

Chickahominy Indian Tribe-Eastern Division	NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO)	when federally recognized GARFO participated in EPA Region 3 Summit Sent letter of introduction from GARFO Regional Administrator when federally recognized GARFO participated in EPA Region 3 Summit
Monacan Indian Nation	 NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) 	 Sent letter of introduction from GARFO Regional Administrator when federally recognized GARFO participated in EPA Region 3 Summit
Nansemond Indian Tribe	 NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) 	 Sent letter of introduction from GARFO Regional Administrator when federally recognized GARFO participated in EPA Region 3 Summit
Pamunkey Indian Tribe	 NOAA/Chesapeake Bay Office (CBO) NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Office of Protected Resources (OPR) 	 Support resilient (i.e., living shorelines) shorelines in the York-Piankatank-Mobjack Bay system. This is an initiative with CBO in the York River tidal system. It also a goal of a proposed NOAA Habitat Focus Area. Has a NOAA Species Recovery Grant for Atlantic sturgeon with the National Marine Fisheries Service's (NMFS) Office of Protected Resources (OPR); potential opportunities for further engagement on sturgeon restoration.
Rappahannock Tribe, Inc.	 NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO) 	Sent letter of introduction from GARFO Regional Administrator

		when federally recognized GARFO participated in EPA Region 3 Summit
Upper Mattaponi Tribe	NOAA/National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS)/Greater Atlantic Fisheries Office (GARFO)	 Sent letter of introduction from GARFO Regional Administrator when federally recognized GARFO participated in EPA Region 3 Summit

APPENDIX F: Resources Shared

- 6th EA Workshop on Ecosystem Approach Guidelines and Integrated Ecosystem Assessment, https://pame.is/projects/ecosystem-approach/ea-documents-and-workshop-reports/6th-ea-workshop
- Abenaki Ways of Knowing Water, https://www.uvm.edu/seagrant/resources/videos/nebi-abenaki-ways-knowing-water
- Blue Plan for Connecticut, https://portal.ct.gov/DEEP/Coastal-Resources/LIS-Blue-Plan
- Cultural Importance of River Herring to the Passamaquoddy People, https://www.wabanaki.com/wabanaki new/documents/Passamaquoddy%20and%20River%20
 Herring-Cultural%20Importance%20v5.pdf
- First Light: https://firstlightlearningjourney.net/
- Mashpee Wampanoag Tribe, Preserving Our Homelands, https://www.usgs.gov/media/videos/native-youth-science-preserving-our-homelands
- Mid-Atlantic Regional Ocean Action Plan, https://www.boem.gov/Mid-Atlantic-Regional-Ocean-Action-Plan/
- NOAA's Integrated Ecosystem Assessment, https://www.integratedecosystemassessment.noaa.gov/
- NOAA Live! Webinars, https://seagrant.whoi.edu/noaa-live-webinars/
- NROC's Ocean Action Plan, https://neoceanplanning.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/Northeast-Ocean-Plan Full.pdf
- On This Site: The Shinnecock Sites, https://www.jeremynative.com/onthissite/
- Workshop to Identify National Ocean Exploration Priorities in the Pacific, https://oceanleadership.org/discovery/ocean-exploration-pacific-priorities-workshop/
- Yádiłhił Explorers Weather Poster, https://www.weather.gov/images/fgz/NavajoPoster.jpg