

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						<p>Comment</p> <p>** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment.</p> <p>** Only ONE comment per row, please.</p>
1	9	3	33	3	33	Add "general" after observed and before warming. It is not warming everywhere.
2	9	4	12	4	12	Add "in the past" after "tropical cyclones"?
3	9	4	27	4	28	Delete? How does one constrain an idealized experiment? Much more is needed if kept. It does not seem worth it.
4	9	4	39	4	57	Remaining uncertainities. It seems that it is worth adding some discussion on attributions studies for smaller than global scale regions. As one goes to smaller space scales, the uniqueness of the signal becomes a larger and larger problem. Also it is not obvious to me that the models are good surrogates for the noise. Both of these issues hinder making regional statements.
5	9	6	17	6	18	The association between temperature and precipitation anomalies seems weak to me. Isn't this mainly a midlatitude summer and tropical argument? In cold regions, warm anomalies are associated with increased precipitation.
6	9	9	5	9	36	If the chapter needs shortened, this may be a good place to start (9.1.4). The reader has the outline at the front of the chapter. Also, 9.1 in general seems too long. Some of the material could be moved closer to where it is used. This would also save a few sentences since things tend to be repeated later.
7	9	13	26	13	26	Jargon. Change "with a coupled mixed layer (q-flux) ocean" to "a atmosphere model coupled to a a simple mixed layer ocean model using heat flux adjustments?".
8	9	19	12	19	13	"less consistent" Between what and what? In the future? I am lost.
9	9	19	19	19	21	How confident are you that vegetation feedbacks amplify the response?
10	9	21	4	21	4	Manabe and Wetherald noted this before the dawn of time. They should be referenced.
11	9	35	13	35	13	Is the uniqueness of the signal to a particular forcing a important problem for sub-global attribution studies? I did not see it mentioned.
12	9	39	43	39	43	Add "about" before $14.1 \times 10^{22} \text{J}$. This is a lot of uncertainty in this value.
13	9	40	1	40	2	"small revision downwards of the observed increase in heat content" seems awkward. Change to "a reduction in the heat content trend".
14	9	40	40	40	40	"well reproduced" I would delete "well".
15	9	40	47	40	47	At the end of the sentence, add "particularly the Southern Ocean where models predict most of the oceanic heat uptake occurs".
16	9	42	1	43	12	Too many values...a table would be helpful.

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
17	9	43	30	43	30	By what measure is the 1998 El Nino the "strongest on record"? I assume SST anomalies. Is this also the case if one looks at SLP anomalies?
18	9	44	2	44	3	What is the assessment of the MIROC result?
19	9	45	14	45	30	Somewhere in this paragraph, you should note that the SH jet is poorly located in most models (See 8.3.2).
20	9	47	9	47	13	Should a note be add to say that the upper tropospheric water changes may be important in determining the climate sensitivity and point to the coming discussion?
21	9	48	20	48	20	"at the equator" - "At" should be "near". The increase occurs in the ITCZ.
22	9	49	16	49	16	Type-o. Too many Trenberths.
23	9	49	48	49	54	Isn't the low signal to noise ratio the reall issue here?
24	9	51	31	51	31	"thinning of the ice" Annual average?
25	9	51	31	51	54	Vinnikov et al. 1999 reference needs added. Vinnikov, K. Y., A. Robock, R. J. Stouffer, J. E. Walsh, C. L. Parkinson, D. J. Cavalieri, J. F. B. Mitchell, D. Garrett, and V. F. Zakharov, 1999: Global warming and Northern Hemisphere sea ice extent. Science, 286(5446), 1934-1937.
26	9	57	13	57	14	"and is inconsistent with the climate" is vague. Change to "is an unphysical result".
27						
28						
29						
30						
31						
32						
33						
34						
35						
36						
37						
38						
39						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
40						
41						
42						
43						
44						
45						
46						
47						
48						
49						
50						
51						
52						
53						
54						
55						
56						
57						
58						
59						
60						
61						
62						
63						
64						
65						
66						
67						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
68						
69						
70						
71						
72						
73						
74						
75						
76						
77						
78						
79						
80						
81						
82						
83						
84						
85						
86						
87						
88						
89						
90						
91						
92						
93						
94						
95						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
96						
97						
98						
99						
100						
101						
102						
103						
104						
105						
106						
107						
108						
109						
110						
111						
112						
113						
114						
115						
116						
117						
118						
119						
120						
121						
122						
123						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
124						
125						
126						
127						
128						
129						
130						
131						
132						
133						
134						
135						
136						
137						
138						
139						
140						
141						
142						
143						
144						
145						
146						
147						
148						
149						
150						
151						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
152						
153						
154						
155						
156						
157						
158						
159						
160						
161						
162						
163						
164						
165						
166						
167						
168						
169						
170						
171						
172						
173						
174						
175						
176						
177						
178						
179						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
180						
181						
182						
183						
184						
185						
186						
187						
188						
189						
190						
191						
192						
193						
194						
195						
196						
197						
198						
199						
200						
201						
202						
203						
204						
205						
206						
207						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
208						
209						
210						
211						
212						
213						
214						
215						
216						
217						
218						
219						
220						
221						
222						
223						
224						
225						
226						
227						
228						
229						
230						
231						
232						
233						
234						
235						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
236						
237						
238						
239						
240						
241						
242						
243						
244						
245						
246						
247						
248						
249						
250						
251						
252						
253						
254						
255						
256						
257						
258						
259						
260						
261						
262						
263						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
264						
265						
266						
267						
268						
269						
270						
271						
272						
273						
274						
275						
276						
277						
278						
279						
280						
281						
282						
283						
284						
285						
286						
287						
288						
289						
290						
291						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
292						
293						
294						
295						
296						
297						
298						
299						
300						
301						
302						
303						
304						
305						
306						
307						
308						
309						
310						
311						
312						
313						
314						
315						
316						
317						
318						
319						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
320						
321						
322						
323						
324						
325						
326						
327						
328						
329						
330						
331						
332						
333						
334						
335						
336						
337						
338						
339						
340						
341						
342						
343						
344						
345						
346						
347						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
348						
349						
350						
351						
352						
353						
354						
355						
356						
357						
358						
359						
360						
361						
362						
363						
364						
365						
366						
367						
368						
369						
370						
371						
372						
373						
374						
375						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
376						
377						
378						
379						
380						
381						
382						
383						
384						
385						
386						
387						
388						
389						
390						
391						
392						
393						
394						
395						
396						
397						
398						
399						
400						
401						
402						
403						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
404						
405						
406						
407						
408						
409						
410						
411						
412						
413						
414						
415						
416						
417						
418						
419						
420						
421						
422						
423						
424						
425						
426						
427						
428						
429						
430						
431						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
432						
433						
434						
435						
436						
437						
438						
439						
440						
441						
442						
443						
444						
445						
446						
447						
448						
449						
450						
451						
452						
453						
454						
455						
456						
457						
458						
459						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
460						
461						
462						
463						
464						
465						
466						
467						
468						
469						
470						
471						
472						
473						
474						
475						
476						
477						
478						
479						
480						
481						
482						
483						
484						
485						
486						
487						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
488						
489						
490						
491						
492						
493						
494						
495						
496						
497						
498						
499						
500						
501						
502						
503						
504						
505						
506						
507						
508						
509						
510						
511						
512						
513						
514						
515						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
516						
517						
518						
519						
520						
521						
522						
523						
524						
525						
526						
527						
528						
529						
530						
531						
532						
533						
534						
535						
536						
537						
538						
539						
540						
541						
542						
543						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
544						
545						
546						
547						
548						
549						
550						
551						
552						
553						
554						
555						
556						
557						
558						
559						
560						
561						
562						
563						
564						
565						
566						
567						
568						
569						
570						
571						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
572						
573						
574						
575						
576						
577						
578						
579						
580						
581						
582						
583						
584						
585						
586						
587						
588						
589						
590						
591						
592						
593						
594						
595						
596						
597						
598						
599						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
600						
601						
602						
603						
604						
605						
606						
607						
608						
609						
610						
611						
612						
613						
614						
615						
616						
617						
618						
619						
620						
621						
622						
623						
624						
625						
626						
627						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
628						
629						
630						
631						
632						
633						
634						
635						
636						
637						
638						
639						
640						
641						
642						
643						
644						
645						
646						
647						
648						
649						
650						
651						
652						
653						
654						
655						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
656						
657						
658						
659						
660						
661						
662						
663						
664						
665						
666						
667						
668						
669						
670						
671						
672						
673						
674						
675						
676						
677						
678						
679						
680						
681						
682						
683						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
684						
685						
686						
687						
688						
689						
690						
691						
692						
693						
694						
695						
696						
697						
698						
699						
700						
701						
702						
703						
704						
705						
706						
707						
708						
709						
710						
711						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
712						
713						
714						
715						
716						
717						
718						
719						
720						
721						
722						
723						
724						
725						
726						
727						
728						
729						
730						
731						
732						
733						
734						
735						
736						
737						
738						
739						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
740						
741						
742						
743						
744						
745						
746						
747						
748						
749						
750						
751						
752						
753						
754						
755						
756						
757						
758						
759						
760						
761						
762						
763						
764						
765						
766						
767						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
768						
769						
770						
771						
772						
773						
774						
775						
776						
777						
778						
779						
780						
781						
782						
783						
784						
785						
786						
787						
788						
789						
790						
791						
792						
793						
794						
795						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
796						
797						
798						
799						
800						
801						
802						
803						
804						
805						
806						
807						
808						
809						
810						
811						
812						
813						
814						
815						
816						
817						
818						
819						
820						
821						
822						
823						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
824						
825						
826						
827						
828						
829						
830						
831						
832						
833						
834						
835						
836						
837						
838						
839						
840						
841						
842						
843						
844						
845						
846						
847						
848						
849						
850						
851						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
852						
853						
854						
855						
856						
857						
858						
859						
860						
861						
862						
863						
864						
865						
866						
867						
868						
869						
870						
871						
872						
873						
874						
875						
876						
877						
878						
879						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
880						
881						
882						
883						
884						
885						
886						
887						
888						
889						
890						
891						
892						
893						
894						
895						
896						
897						
898						
899						
900						
901						
902						
903						
904						
905						
906						
907						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
908						
909						
910						
911						
912						
913						
914						
915						
916						
917						
918						
919						
920						
921						
922						
923						
924						
925						
926						
927						
928						
929						
930						
931						
932						
933						
934						
935						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
936						
937						
938						
939						
940						
941						
942						
943						
944						
945						
946						
947						
948						
949						
950						
951						
952						
953						
954						
955						
956						
957						
958						
959						
960						
961						
962						
963						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
964						
965						
966						
967						
968						
969						
970						
971						
972						
973						
974						
975						
976						
977						
978						
979						
980						
981						
982						
983						
984						
985						
986						
987						
988						
989						
990						
991						

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLE-CLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. ** Only ONE comment per row, please.
992						
993						
994						
995						
996						
997						
998						
999						
1000						